

Historic Battlefields Consultation

Question 1

Yes.

Question 2

The scope is perhaps a bit narrow: sieges, massacres &c., do not in fact present greater issues of definition or location and should be considered for inclusion where of national significance. I would place more emphasis on historic importance or significant outcome of conflicts, rather than defining them by size, extent or number of combatants.

Question 3

There are also potential military technological advances to consider, apart from strategy and tactics, which may only be discovered initially through documentary sources and may need confirmation by field survey.

Question 4

Yes, but this should be supported by an inventory of all conflict sites which would provide a context for those considered worthy of further protection according to more precise criteria.

Question 5

Yes.

Question 6

Yes, but see response to question 4. Sites of perceived 'national importance' cannot be considered in isolation – context is required.

Question 7

Yes; however it is important to compare regularly the candidate sites to the criteria set down in order to reflect latest research and current knowledge, hence the importance of including all sites of conflict. Over time, conflicts may become eligible for inclusion in or removal from a register of sites compiled simply to satisfy the basic criteria.

Question 8

Yes; and see answer to question 7.

Question 9

Yes; as it is very difficult, without extensive excavation, to define accurately the areas in which different events took place, a flexible approach is needed whereby the policies affecting different areas may need to change to reflect current knowledge.

Question 10

Yes; the Royal Commission on the Ancient & Historical Monuments of Scotland would seem to be a natural lead for the development of national archaeological recording standards, working alongside partners such as the regional archaeologists and Historic Scotland.

Question 11

Broadly, yes; although HS will create and maintain the Inventory, it should be derived from basic information provided by or channelled through RCAHMS (in effect the broader 'inventory' of all conflict sites (see response to Q4)).

Name: Brian Malaws

Postal Address: Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Wales,
Crown Building, Plas Crug, Aberystwyth, Ceredigion SY23 1NJ

1. Are you responding: **(please delete the line that does not relate to your situation)**

~~_____ (a) as an individual _____ go to Q2a/b and then Q4~~

(b) **on behalf of** a group/organisation go to Q3 and then Q4

INDIVIDUALS

2a. Do you agree to your response being made available to the public (in Scottish Government library and/or on the Scottish Government website)?

(please delete the line that does not relate to your situation)

Yes (go to 2b below)

No, not at all

We will treat your response as confidential

2b. **Where confidentiality is not requested**, we will make your response available to the public on the following basis **(please delete the lines that do not relate to your situation)**

Yes, make my response, name and address all available

Yes, make my response available, but not my name or address

Yes, make my response and name available, but not my address

ON BEHALF OF GROUPS OR ORGANISATIONS:

3 The name and address of your organisation **will be** made available to the public (in the Scottish Government library and/or on the Scottish Government website). Are you also content for your **response** to be made available? **(please delete the line that does not relate to your situation)**

Yes

~~_____ No _____ We will treat your response as confidential~~

SHARING RESPONSES/FUTURE ENGAGEMENT

4 We will share your response internally with other Scottish Government policy teams who may be addressing the issues you discuss. They may wish to contact you again in the future, but we require your permission to do so. Are you content for the Scottish Government to contact you again in the future in relation to this consultation response?

(please delete the line that does not relate to your situation)

Yes

~~_____ No _____~~