

# 1<sup>st</sup> Marquis of Montrose Society



Chairman: Lt. Col Malcolm McVittie

---

11 July 2008

SHEP on Battlefields  
Historic Scotland  
Longmore House  
Edinburgh

Dear Sir/Madam,

## **The Scottish Historic Environment Policy**

The 1<sup>st</sup> Marquis of Montrose Society welcomes the proposal to introduce a formal policy for the protection and management of historic battlefields. The Scope and Definition detailed on page 12 of the consultation booklet offers protection to clearly defined battlefields but there are battlefields, such as Tippermuir near Perth (1644), where the exact positions the combatants occupied before the battle are still debated today. Although perhaps few in number we would suggest that these battlefields may require the area of protection to be more extensive. The difficulty of defining the exact position of the combatants before a battle however should not determine whether a battlefield should or should not receive the protection which it deserves, or whether it should receive less protection than other clearly defined battlefields.

Our society has been active in the last year or so in careful examination of the circumstances surrounding the battle of Tippermuir and our conclusions have certainly cast doubt on the generally accepted battle formations prior to the battle. Defining the area of a battle (page 17) is critical to the process and we trust that all interested parties would have a chance to contribute during this phase.

We are of the opinion that an inventory of historic battlefields should be given every bit as much prominence as that enjoyed by Gardens and Designed Landscapes. Indeed we would argue that a policy of such national importance as one which protects our historic battlefields should perhaps be written in statute.

Whilst we agree with the purpose of the proposed inventory we would suggest that the criteria for selecting suitable sites for inclusion may allow some significant clan battle sites, where perhaps only a few hundred combatants fought an engagement which could not be considered to have national significance, to fall through the net.

Whilst we do generally welcome the proposal for the creation of a policy for the protection of historic battlefields we would urge that Council planners should be made fully aware that the associated powers of protection for such sites will be applied robustly, and that the refusal of proposed developments on a site included in the

Society Secretary:

Brian Robertson, 14 Silverknowes Bank, EDINBURGH EH4 5PB  
Pho: 0131 336 4039 E-Mail: Robs14@blueyonder.co.uk

inventory should be the norm and not the exception. Few sites have not suffered in recent years from the encroachment of developers and for this policy to be successful in its aims of protecting such sites it must establish a high level of protection, and then be prepared to enforce it,

Yours faithfully,

Mr Brian Robertson  
Secretary  
1<sup>st</sup> Marquis of Montrose Society.

14 Silverknowes Bank  
Edinburgh  
EH4 5PB