

13/07/08

Dear Dr Barclay,

I shall keep my responses brief, as there are many better-qualified than I am in terms of active interest & involvement.

- Q 1 :- Yes - we need a policy for protection/sust. management.
 Q 2 :- The definition appears to me to be satisfactory.
 Q 3 :- No; those are the main reasons
 Q 4 :- Yes; a non-statutory list is the least contentious way ahead.
 Q 5 :- I can hardly see how you could do this in certain cases, because some battlefields have already been so 'overprinted' with insensitive later development - BANNOCKBURN is an extreme case. I suspect a greater degree of flexibility is called for, but on 'unspoiled' sites I would answer YES.
 Q 6 :- Yes; I'm happy with the proposed purpose of the Inventory
 Q 7 :- I think the Annex A criteria are satisfactory.
 Q 8 :- I am in agreement.
 Q 9 :- " " "
 Q 10 :- Best Practice is the only sensible guide, tho' it will be naturally modified & developed in specific Scottish contexts. The U.S. Park Service practice on War of Independence & Civil War battlefield park sites is the best with which I am familiar, & worth studying.
 Q 11 :- I agree with the definitions of stakeholder roles.

All that apart, I have only two other points to submit to the Consultation. Both are tangential to, or not really encompassed by the Document to which I have responded above.

PT A :- Some battlefield features may well be linked to other historical developments worthy of conservation. These shd not be forgotten. For example: the upper reaches of the Bannockburn, very close to the battlefield, were from c 1760 a cradle of the industrial revolution in Scotland & the site of a series of mills belonging to Messrs Wilson of Bannockburn who first established a corner in tartans for Highland Regiments in the late C18 & then in the C19 virtually created the modern system of clean tartans. Their Royal George Mill of 1822-3 (commemorating Prince's Turret) still stands on a neglected but superb (from below) Telford bridge. A linear "Bannock burn walk", and/or a museum of tartans (or at least a Tartan Trail) are obvious possibilities that should not be precluded by over-concentration on a badly damaged medieval battle-site nearby.

PT B :- Though I currently work on military engineers & rival European overseas empires in the Caribbean & Asia & ceased to research Jacobites two decades ago, I recently became aware of the awkward problems posed by the most 'important' Jacobite battle-site - Sheriffmuir. Gullodien was a foregone conclusion. Sheriffmuir changes history by depriving the '15 of impetus. Battlefield Archaeology enables us now to grasp and localise the significant action. Something needs to be done about this neglected & difficult site. On that note, I am
 Yours sincerely, R. P. D.