

SUPPLEMENTARY INFORMATION FOR INTERNAL CONSIDERATION ON THE TIORAM PEER GROUP

A. INTRODUCTION

A.1. *To supplement the information that Geoffrey Stell (GS) was asked to provide in his statement of cultural significance on Castle Tioram, brief notes are offered here on each of the main members of the peer group that he has identified. (in addition to the details provided by GS, information has been drawn from the volumes of the Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland and the Buildings of Scotland series.) A sheet of plans of all members of the principal peer group, reproduced to a uniform scale, has also been provided.*

Following the notes on the peer group identified by GS, notes are provided on a number of other West Coast buildings that show some relationship of form with Castle Tioram, in order to provide a wider context; all of these are either briefly discussed or mentioned in passing in GS's statement of cultural significance.

Attached to the note on each building in the two groups is a preliminary attempt to assess its significance on the basis of the 'Criteria for and guidance on the determination of "national importance" under the terms of the Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979', as published in Scottish historic environment policy 2. Scheduling: protecting Scotland's nationally important monuments. The assessments are also set out in tabular form.

It should be stressed, however, that these castles are assessed here purely as members of the principal and secondary Tioram peer group, and in all cases they are likely to be of varying degrees of interest in other respects. (Dunvegan, for example, is of very high significance as a post-medieval house, though its Tioram-related aspects have been largely obscured. Similarly, the modern restorations of Duntrune and Duart are of significance in their own right, but have a limited bearing on the relevance of those castles in considering the peer groups.)

B. NOTES ON THE CASTLES OF THE PRINCIPAL PEER GROUP, WITH AN ASSESSMENT OF THEIR SIGNIFICANCE

B.1. CASTLE CALVAY. (Scheduled) An irregular enclosure almost completely covering the rock of an islet connected to Calvay island by a causeway, and with a small harbour nearby. Of the buildings within the curtain, that on the north side evidently rose to two storeys. The whole complex is extremely fragmentary, rising to no more than four metres at any point, but to a lesser height generally. There is no consensus on the date, though GS suggests it is late medieval.

ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

1. Intrinsic characteristics:

a. condition This site is not very well preserved. LOW

b. archaeological interest There has been no attempt to assess the archaeological potential. NOT KNOWN

c. developmental sequence NOT KNOWN

d. function NOT KNOWN

2. Contextual characteristics:

e. rarity or representativeness Considered as a likely member of the principal Tioram peer group it is of high interest. HIGH

f. relationship to other monuments Considered as a likely member of the principal Tioram peer group it is of high interest. HIGH

g. relationship to wider setting NOT KNOWN

3. Associative characteristics:

h. historical, cultural and social influences NOT KNOWN

i. aesthetic attributes LOW

j. significance to national consciousness LOW

k. associations with people or events NOT KNOWN

B.2. CASTLE TIORAM. (Scheduled and A-listed) A basically pentagonal enclosure defined by high curtain walls, and with well preserved ranges along the south and east sides of the courtyard; these ranges embody a unique 'hall-tower' as an element that is contemporary with the curtain wall. Although the castle has traditionally been dated to the 13th century, GS proposes a date of 1346x73, when there is the first documentary reference to it. It was recognised as the principal residence of Clanranald from then until at least the earlier 18th century. GS suggests there were probably modifications c.1530s and c.1610, and there are documented repairs in 1668-76. The main evidence for the later works is seen in the heightening of walls and ranges, the addition of angle bartizans and the provision of a stair tower. There may also have been some later modifications to adapt it as a barrack. A new house (Dorlin House) was built nearby c.1864, though with no evident visual inter-relationship between house and castle. That house is now gone.

ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE**1. Intrinsic characteristics:**

a. condition Assessed on the basis of its relative completeness, VERY HIGH

b. archaeological interest HIGH

c. developmental sequence The majority of what survives dates from a relatively short date span, and the evidence for the sequence is relatively clear. HIGH

d. function The castle embodies important evidence for the uses to which it was put and how the buildings were modified to meet changed needs; these include an early 'hall tower' and a later presumed taniist's house. VERY HIGH

2. Contextual characteristics:

e. rarity or representativeness As one of a small group of West Highland enclosure castles, VERY HIGH

f. relationship to other monuments As one of a small group of West Highland enclosure castles, VERY HIGH

g. relationship to wider setting A study of the documentation and the physical setting has revealed that, almost uniquely, the castle's mensal lands were a considerable distance away from the castle. The castle is now also deemed to have a particularly important aesthetic relationship with its landscape setting. VERY HIGH

3. Associative characteristics:

h. historical, cultural and social influences Its design shows a complex range of influences, from Ireland, Scotland, and possible also Wales. VERY HIGH

i. aesthetic attributes Although its remoteness meant it attracted little artistic attention until recent times, the castle's relationship with its landscape setting is now generally considered to be particularly attractive. HIGH

j. significance to national consciousness As the home of Clanranald over about three centuries, the castle has highly significant resonances for our understanding of Gaelic lordship and patronage. HIGH

k. associations with people or events As the home of Clanranald over about three centuries, the castle has highly significant resonances for our understanding of Gaelic lordship and patronage. It is also of significance for its role in the Jacobite risings and the Hanoverian response. VERY HIGH

B.3. DUNOON CASTLE. (Scheduled and B-listed) A roughly rectangular enclosure on a mound at the seaward end of a promontory at the narrowest point of the Firth of Clyde. There is some evidence that a castle has been here from the 13th century, though the 'dun' element of the place name may point to earlier occupation of the site. By the early 19th century the structures had been almost entirely lost to view, but some of them were re-exposed in the 1820s, since when there has been much rebuilding and refacing, and in places exposed masonry now rises to a height of around 2.5 metres, though it is difficult to gain any coherent view of the architecture as a whole.

ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

1. Intrinsic characteristics:

a. condition extremely fragmentary. LOW

b. archaeological interest NOT KNOWN

c. developmental sequence NOT KNOWN

d. function NOT KNOWN

2. Contextual characteristics:

e. rarity or representativeness Considered as a likely member of the principal Tioram peer group it is of moderate interest. MODERATE

f. relationship to other monuments Considered as a likely member of the principal Tioram peer group it is of moderate interest. MODERATE

g. relationship to wider setting NOT KNOWN

3. Associative characteristics:

h. historical, cultural and social influences NOT KNOWN

i. aesthetic attributes LOW

j. significance to national consciousness LOW

k. associations with people or events NOT KNOWN

B.4. DUNSTAFFNAGE CASTLE. (Scheduled, a Property in Care and A-listed) The most architecturally ambitious member of the group, and the largest after Dunvegan. The dun element of the name may point to early occupation of the site, and prehistoric pottery has been found through excavation. The castle is a massively constructed quadrangular enclosure with round towers sunk at the angles, it occupies a rock outcrop at the seaward approach to Loch Etive, with a good nearby anchorage. On the architectural evidence the castle is assumed to have been built in the mid-13th century for the MacDougalls of Lorn, and there is a finely detailed chapel of similar date nearby. After passing to the Campbell family, around the turn of the 15th and 16th centuries, the entrance gateway and at least one of the courtyard ranges were remodelled. Further alterations followed in the 17th and 18th centuries, and the north-west range was again remodelled in 1725. The gatehouse was gutted by fire in 1810. It was taken into state care in 1962 (apart from the upper floors of the gatehouse, which are the nominal residence of the captains of Dunstaffnage).

ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

1. Intrinsic characteristics:

a. condition The curtain wall is very well preserved, as is the modified gatehouse and the shell of one of the later internal buildings. VERY HIGH

b. archaeological interest Limited excavations have established that this is VERY HIGH

c. developmental sequence The evidence for the phases of building is relatively clear, HIGH

d. function The buildings within the curtain wall have been extensively modified, and the functions of the original buildings are no longer clear; the functions of the later buildings are relatively clearly identifiable. MODERATE

2. Contextual characteristics:

e. rarity or representativeness Although the most ambitious of the Tioram peer group of West Coast enclosure castles its great scale, massive construction, and circular angle towers mean that, while it is one of a rare group, it is only partly representative of that group. HIGH

f. relationship to other monuments This was the most ambitious of the Tioram peer group of West Coast enclosure castles, though its great scale and massive construction mean that it is only partly representative of that group. HIGH

g. relationship to wider setting Although no longer as visible as some other members of this group, the setting has an evident strategic relationship with the approaches to Loch Etive. HIGH

3. Associative characteristics:

h. historical, cultural and social influences It is an important illustration of how the type of castle consisting of a quadrangular enclosure with towers at the angles could be adapted to the exigencies of an irregular rock outcrop. HIGH

i. aesthetic attributes As a structurally largely complete curtain wall rising from a scarped rock outcrop, and set on lawns against a backdrop of mature trees, the castle is visually highly appealing. HIGH

j. significance to national consciousness As a castle built for the MacDougalls, and later taken under Campbell control, the castle had a role in the politics of the Western Highlands. MODERATE

k. associations with people or events As at 3j. MODERATE

B.5. DUNTRUNE CASTLE. (B-listed) Occupying a rocky promontory on the north side of Loch Crinan, with a boat landing below, the dun place-name element could point to early occupation of the site. It was held by the Campbells of Lochawe from 1315, and the designation ‘of Duntrune’ was applied to this branch of the family from 1448. The castle is an irregular pentagon with rounded corners, the curtain walls of which are thought to be of the 15th century (perhaps of c.1448). At the southern angle the main residence, which is of L-shaped plan is thought to date from c.1600, and there was later barrack accommodation in the courtyard. In 1796 the castle was restored for Neil Malcolm of Poltalloch, but the family built a new house at Poltalloch itself c.1850. Duntrune was again restored by George Malcolm in 1954-7 after the abandonment of the 19th-century Poltalloch House. It is one of only two castles of this group still to be habitable (the other being Dunvegan), though it has not been continuously occupied.

ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

1. Intrinsic characteristics:

a. condition Very good condition, but largely as a result of modern restorations. HIGH

b. archaeological interest Possibly at least partly compromised in the course of modern restorations. NOT KNOWN

c. developmental sequence Most of the buildings within the courtyard were later than the curtain wall, and have since been heavily restored, with consequent disturbance of evidence. MODERATE

d. function While the principal functions for which the various buildings were originally constructed is broadly clear, the architecture has been modified to meet modern requirements. MODERATE

2. Contextual characteristics:

e. rarity or representativeness This is assumed to be a late representative of this peer group, suggesting that the forms were a long-lived form of response to a particular type of site. MODERATE

f. relationship to other monuments A late representative of the Tioram peer group. MODERATE

g. relationship to wider setting A splendidly sited castle having a clear relationship with a landing for the boats that were its main form of communication with the wider world. HIGH

3. Associative characteristics:

h. historical, cultural and social influences NOT KNOWN

i. aesthetic attributes As at 2g, but modified by modern restoration. MODERATE

j. significance to national consciousness LOW

k. associations with people or events LOW

B.6. DUNVEGAN CASTLE. (A-listed) The ‘dun’ element of the name may indicate early use of the site, though there is no supporting architectural evidence of this. The castle is on a rock outcrop overlooking a bay on the east shore of Loch Dunvegan, and the irregular configuration of the curtain walls defines a larger area than any other member of this group; those walls are usually assumed to have originated in the 13th century, and the original main entrance is thought to have been on the seaward side. The earliest residential element is a substantial tower at the north-east angle of the platform, which may date from the early 15th century, and perhaps from c.1439 when the family came to be designated as ‘of Dunvegan’. A hall range, terminating in what was probably a chamber tower (the ‘Fairy Tower’), was built along the east side of the enclosure around the early 16th century. A succession of further works are recorded in 1623, 1664, 1684-9, 1748, 1790, 1811-14 and 1840-50, resulting in a flat-roofed and crenellated complex of ranges within which the medieval buildings were largely subsumed, and that bore only limited resemblance to what was there before the 17th century. Nevertheless, Dunvegan is the only castle of this group that has been continuously occupied – and by the same family – since its first construction, though parts of the complex are known to have been uninhabitable at stages of their history. The Macleods of Dunvegan were the only family that could rival the extent of the artistic patronage of Clanranald at Tioram, though, unlike at Tioram, the extensive rebuilding at Dunvegan now makes it almost impossible to appreciate the architectural context of that patronage. There are also parallels with Tioram in the way that the family’s burial place was at some distance from their principal seat, being at Rodel, some 20 nautical miles away: a further reminder of the maritime basis of the major West Coast estates.

ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

1. Intrinsic characteristics:

a. condition Generally acceptable condition but largely as a result of post-medieval rebuilding and enlargement. HIGH

b. archaeological interest NOT KNOWN

c. developmental sequence A combination of the architectural and the documentary evidence makes the post-medieval building sequence moderately clear; the medieval sequence, however, has been largely obscured by the rebuilding. MODERATE

d. function The functions of the late medieval buildings within the courtyard are partly evident despite the fact that they are now absorbed within the later buildings; the functions of any earlier buildings are unknown. LOW

2. Contextual characteristics:

e. rarity or representativeness It has particular interest as a castle that has been in continuous occupation since being built; however, that interest now has only moderate bearing on our ability to understand the principal Tioram peer group. MODERATE

f. relationship to other monuments As a possible member of the principal Tioram peer group on the evidence of the configuration of its curtain wall, insufficient is known to be able to establish direct relationships. LOW

g. relationship to wider setting The relationship between the home of a major Gaelic landholder and his maritime estate remains clear from the siting and planning of this castle. HIGH

3. Associative characteristics:

h. historical, cultural and social influences The original building has been so obscured by later building that it is difficult to be sure of the influences that originally underlay the design. NOT KNOWN

i. aesthetic attributes MODERATE

j. significance to national consciousness It is perhaps now the best known residence of a leading West Highland landholder. HIGH

k. associations with people or events The castle is of great importance as the home of the McLeods of Dunvegan since its first construction. HIGH

B.7. MINGARY CASTLE. (Scheduled and A-listed) On a promontory projecting into the sea and commanding views of the Sound of Mull and the island of Coll, the earlier ownership of the land is uncertain, though in the later 14th century it was granted to Angus MacIan, the ancestor of the MacIans of Ardnmamurchan. Its curtain wall, which defines an irregular hexagonal plan, has traditionally been dated to the 13th century, though GS argues for an early 14th-century date. Later medieval alterations include late 16th-century remodelling of the seaward sections of the upper curtain wall, with the addition of angle rounds. The earliest of the buildings within the courtyard appear to post-date the loss of the lands by the MacIans in the late 17th century, evidently dating from two main periods in the 18th century. Although smaller than Tioram, the plan and form of the curtain wall of Mingary offer the closest counterpart to that of Tioram among the main peer group.

ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

1. Intrinsic characteristics:

a. condition HIGH

b. archaeological interest HIGH

c. developmental sequence The developmental sequence is largely evident from the surviving fabric. HIGH

d. function Later rebuilding of the structures within the courtyard has left the functions of the original buildings unclear. MODERATE

2. Contextual characteristics:

e. rarity or representativeness Considered as a member of the small contemporary Tioram peer group, which shows the closest parallels with Tioram in its overall forms, it is of very high interest. VERY HIGH

f. relationship to other monuments As the member of the principal Tioram peer group which bears the closest resemblance to Tioram, it is of the very highest interest. VERY HIGH

g. relationship to wider setting Like Tioram, it is a clear expression of the maritime orientation of the leaders of the society for which it was built. VERY HIGH

3. Associative characteristics:

h. historical, cultural and social influences As with Tioram, its design shows a complex range of influences, from Ireland, Scotland, and possibly also Wales. VERY HIGH

i. aesthetic attributes As with Tioram, although its remoteness meant it attracted little artistic attention until recent times, the castle's relationship with its landscape setting is now generally considered to be particularly attractive. HIGH

j. significance to national consciousness NOT KNOWN

k. associations with people or events As a castle built for the MacIans of Ardnamurchan, and later taken under Campbell control, the castle has had a role in the politics of the Western Highlands. MODERATE

C. NOTES ON THE CASTLES OF THE SECONDARY PEER GROUP, WITH AN ASSESSMENT OF THEIR SIGNIFICANCE IN RELATION TO THE PRINCIPAL TIORAM PEER GROUP

C.1. ACHADUN CASTLE. (Scheduled and B-listed). Located on the island of Lismore, the 'dun' element of the place name may indicate early occupation of the site. The castle was a square enclosure defined by a substantial curtain wall and is on a limestone ridge, with a sheer cliff to one side. It was built as their principal residence by the bishops of Argyll in the 13th century, and masons marks suggest the same masons were involved as those who built the cathedral at Lismore. A hall range with a latrine block at one end occupied one side of the courtyard, and there are traces of a forebuilding in front of the main entrance. Apart from taller sections of the NW and NE curtains it is now very fragmentary. The castle is assumed to have been largely abandoned following the construction of Saddell Castle in 1508-12.

ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE IN RELATION TO THE PRINCIPAL TIORAM PEER GROUP

1. Intrinsic characteristics:

a. condition The general state of preservation is poor, though some parts stand to significant height. MODERATE

b. archaeological interest Limited excavations have clarified the internal planning, though it is likely much evidence remains undisturbed. MODERATE

c. developmental sequence The evidence suggests a largely unified structure, with only relatively minor modifications. MODERATE

d. function Its function as an episcopal residence is of considerable interest, but this is not directly relevant for the principal Tioram peer group. LOW

2. Contextual characteristics:

e. rarity or representativeness It is of interest as an episcopal residence, and as a possible early example of a West Coast curtain wall castle, though its square plan is not directly relevant for the principal Tioram peer group. LOW

f. relationship to other monuments Its relationships are closer to other rectangular castles (Sween in the 12th century and Lachlan in the 15th century, for example) than to the principal Tioram peer group. LOW

g. relationship to wider setting Its proximity to the coast is a reminder of the significance of maritime communications for prelates as well as for magnates. MODERATE

3. Associative characteristics:

h. historical, cultural and social influences As one of a small number of earlier rectangular curtain wall castles it is of interest in itself, though this is not directly relevant for the principal Tioram peer group. MODERATE

i. aesthetic attributes Although appealing to modern eyes, there is little to suggest it was deemed attractive by earlier generations. LOW

j. significance to national consciousness NOT KNOWN

k. associations with people or events An important example of an early episcopal residence, though this is not relevant for the principal Tioram peer group. LOW

C.2. BREACHACHA CASTLE (A-Listed) It occupies a low rocky promontory at the head of Loch Breachacha on Coll, and there was a convenient anchorage nearby. The castle was the seat of the MacLeans of Coll and probably dates from the first half of the 15th century. Its form is similar to that of other West Highland castles of the later medieval period with a rectangular tower-house (which was remodelled in the late 16th century) to one side of an irregular enclosure with a round tower at its south angle. The enclosure contains a hall range which was later converted into a three storey dwelling house in the 17th century. The curtain wall that abuts the tower is thought to have been built later, though possibly not by very much. The Castle was restored between 1965-68.

ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE IN RELATION TO PRINCIPAL TIORAM PEER GROUP

1. Intrinsic characteristics:

a. condition This site is well preserved although its restoration has obscured original fabric. However, in relation to the principal Tioram peer group its interest is low. LOW

b. archaeological interest HIGH

c. developmental sequence Datable stylistic features are absent, and there is debate about its date and development. However, the development of the castle, with towerhouse and then barmkin or enclosure wall, is a different concept from that of the enclosure castles of the principal Tioram peer group. There are strong similarities between Breachacha Castle and Kisimul Castle. MODERATE

d. function While the functions for which the various buildings were constructed are broadly clear, the architecture has been modified to meet modern requirements. MODERATE

2. Contextual characteristics:

e. rarity or representativeness It is not considered to be a member of the principal Tioram peer group. Instead it is an example of tower-barmkin castle found elsewhere in the West Highlands (Moy (Mull) Kisimul (Barra)) and Scotland as a whole, in the 15th century. In relation to the principal Tioram peer group its interest is low. LOW

f. relationship to other monuments It is not considered to be a member of the principal Tioram peer group. Instead it is an example of tower-barmkin castle found elsewhere in the West Highlands (Moy (Mull) Kisimul (Barra)) and Scotland as a whole, in the 15th century. In relation to the principal Tioram peer group its interest is low. LOW

g. relationship to wider setting The location of the castle at the head of Loch Breacheacha demonstrates the importance of sea power in this area of Scotland throughout the medieval period. MODERATE

3. Associative characteristics:

h. historical, cultural and social The form of Breacheacha, although having some superficial similarities to the principal Tioram peer group, reflects a different trend in Scottish castle building that is also seen at Kisimul Castle LOW

i. aesthetic attributes Situated at the head of Loch Breacheacha its relationship with its landscape setting is attractive (it was sketched by Poole in the 1840s). MODERATE.

j. significance to national consciousness NOT KNOWN

k. associations with people or events influences As the seat of a sept of the MacLeans of Duart it is of low importance in relation to the principal Tioram peer group. LOW

C.3. CASTLE LACHLAN. (Scheduled and A-listed) This castle, which was the chief residence of the MacLachlan family until 1790, is located on a rocky promontory on the shore of Loch Fyne, and there is a small boat inlet nearby. Although a castle was recorded here in the early 14th century, the present building is thought to be largely of the early 15th and early 16th centuries. The defining (and earliest) feature is a substantial curtain wall of irregular rectangular plan, with a later wall covering the entrance through the south side. Within the courtyard two ranges of c.1500 ran along the east and west sides, with a shorter connecting range along the north side. There have been major collapses at the north-east and south-west corners, although much of the castle survives to the wall head, along parts of which is still the crenellated parapet.

ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE IN RELATION TO THE PRINCIPAL TIORAM PEER GROUP

1. Intrinsic characteristics:

a. condition Although in generally well preserved condition, it is only partly relevant for the principal Tioram peer group. MODERATE

b. archaeological interest This has not been investigated, but is unlikely to be more than marginally relevant for the principal Tioram peer group. NOT KNOWN

c. developmental sequence This is relatively clear, but is not directly relevant for the principal Tioram peer group. MODERATE

d. function The completeness of the remains makes it possible to interpret the use of the buildings within the curtain wall relatively clearly, and these uses may be of some significance for the later buildings of the principal Tioram peer group. MODERATE

2. Contextual characteristics:

e. rarity or representativeness It is an unusually complete example of a rectangular curtain wall castle containing residential ranges, some of which may be of significance for understanding the later buildings of the principal Tioram peer group. MODERATE

f. relationship to other monuments The overall quadrangular form is a reflection of a favoured West Highland type of curtain wall castle found over a long period from the 12th to the 15th centuries, though this is not directly relevant for the more irregularly planned principal Tioram peer group. MODERATE

g. relationship to wider setting Its orientation towards the water rather than the land is characteristic of West Highland castles. MODERATE

3. Associative characteristics:

h. historical, cultural and social influences It is of interest as a representative of one variant on the West Highland curtain wall castle theme; as such, however, the overall form is only partly significant for the principal Tioram peer group, though the internal buildings may be of some relevance. MODERATE

i. aesthetic attributes Although appealing to modern eyes, there is little to suggest it was deemed attractive by earlier generations. MODERATE

j. significance to national consciousness NOT KNOWN

k. associations with people or events As a castle built for a minor family of landholders it has had a role in the social history and politics of the Western Highlands. MODERATE

C.4. CASTLE SWEEN (Scheduled, a Property in Care and A-listed) The castle is situated on a low rocky ridge on the east shore of Loch Sween, close to a number of boat landings. It is believed to have been built by Suibne, ancestor of the MacSween family, at the end of the 12th century, and to be one of the earliest masonry castles in Scotland. It is a rectangular enclosure strengthened by clasping buttresses at the angles and pilaster buttresses in the mid-walls, although the very unlikely suggestion has been made that is the stump of a Norman style keep. The interior walls have chases for timber ranges. During the Menteith family's ownership during the 14th century, a tower with circular latrine tower was added. The final major addition was a rectangular tower added to the north-east angle, probably by the MacNeills of Gigha in the 15th century, which contained a kitchen on the ground floor.

ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE IN RELATION TO PRINCIPAL TIORAM PEER GROUP

1. Intrinsic characteristics:

a. condition It is generally well preserved. HIGH

b. archaeological interest HIGH

c. developmental sequence The developmental sequence is evident from the surviving fabric, though only partly relevant to the principal Tioram peer group. MODERATE

d. function Later rebuilding of the structures within the courtyard has left the functions of the original buildings unclear. MODERATE

2. Contextual characteristics:

e. rarity or representativeness It is a very early castle, and considerably earlier than the principal Tioram peer group. The quadrangular form of the curtain contrasts with the irregular polygonal curtain walls of the peer group, although it does have some similarities, such as the wall walk stair rising above the main gate. MODERATE

f. relationship to other monuments As a very early example of a curtain wall castle, Castle Sween could be seen as an antecedent of the peer group. However, it differs from the principal Tioram peer group in significant ways. It is difficult to say to what degree it influenced other west coast castles of the period. MODERATE

g. relationship to wider setting Like Tioram, it is a clear expression of the maritime orientation of the leaders of the society for which it was built. HIGH

3. Associative characteristics:

h. historical, cultural and social influences The design shows a complex range of influences from Scotland and England. However, in several ways these differ from those which influenced the principal peer group. MODERATE

i. aesthetic attributes The landscape setting, although attractive, has been compromised by a nearby caravan park. MODERATE

j. significance to national consciousness NOT KNOWN

k. associations with people or events The attempt by the MacSweens to regain their castle and lands in Knapdale is subject of a celebrated Gaelic heroic poem. HIGH

C.5. DUART CASTLE (A-Listed) This castle stands on a rocky headland above Duart Point and Duart Bay on the east coast of Mull, commanding the intersection of three major waterways: the Sound of Mull, Loch Linnhe and the Firth of Lorn. It is visible from other important castles, including Dunstaffnage. The castle originally comprised a rectangular curtain wall, traditionally attributed to the 13th century, and presumably erected for the MacDougall lords of Lorn, but is first recorded by Fourdun. The castle was enlarged, probably in the late 14th century, after being acquired by the McLeans, with the addition of large oblong towerhouse. In the mid-16th century ranges were added within the courtyard and the upper-works of the tower-house were remodelled with the addition of corner rounds. In 1673 the north-east range was reconstructed. Following acquisition by the Campbell earls of Argyll in 1674 repairs were carried out but, although garrisoned, it was no longer used as a residence. By 1748 the tower-house was roofless and by the time it was re-acquired by the MacLeans in 1911, it had become ruinous. During the following year it was restored and partially reconstructed

ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE IN RELATION TO PRINCIPAL TIORAM PEER GROUP

1. Intrinsic characteristics:

a. condition This site is well preserved although its restoration has introduced a number of speculative features and the upper works are generally conjectural. HIGH

b. archaeological interest There has been no attempt to assess the archaeological potential but the restoration is likely to have compromised archaeological deposits. NOT KNOWN

c. developmental sequence Although some features and details have been obscured by later medieval additions and 20th-century restoration, the evidence for the phases of building is relatively clear and these are similar to Castle Tioram in some respects, although the curtain wall is rectangular. HIGH

d. function While the functions for which the various buildings were constructed are broadly clear, the architecture has been modified to meet modern requirements. MODERATE

2. Contextual characteristics:

e. rarity or representativeness Considered as a supplementary member of the Tioram peer group it is of moderate interest. MODERATE

f. relationship to other monuments Considered as a supplementary member of the Tioram peer group it is of moderate interest. MODERATE

g. relationship to wider setting The relationship between the home of a major Gaelic landholder and his landed and maritime estate remains clear from the siting and planning. Its command of the seaways and its intervisibility with Dunvegan, Dunnollie, Achadun and Ardtornish demonstrates the supremacy of sea power along the western seaboard. VERY HIGH

3. Associative characteristics:

h. historical, cultural and social Duart demonstrates how a curtain wall castle built within a confined space could be adapted to meet expanding needs. It illustrates a number of trends within Scottish castellated architecture that have some relevance for the principal Tioram peer group. HIGH

i. aesthetic attributes Situated on a prominent rocky point on the approach to Mull, its relationship with its landscape setting is particularly attractive and benefits from being seen from the sea. HIGH

j. significance to national consciousness The restoration of the castle and its associations with the Clan McLean in the 20th century have raised the profile of the castle. MODERATE

k. associations with people or events influences As a built for the MacDougalls, taken over by the McLean's, (one of the most prominent families in the Western Isles), and later taken under Campbell control, the castle had a significant role in the politics of the Western Highlands. HIGH

C.6. INNIS CHONNEL CASTLE. (Scheduled and A-listed) Standing on a small rocky island in Loch Awe opposite the village of Dalavich, this castle was until the late 15th century the chief stronghold of the Campbells. It is believed to have been built in the first half of the 13th century (though only first documented in 1308) as a small, rectangular curtain wall castle, with buildings around the courtyard. The lower sections of the south-east tower retain much early work. It was remodelled in the early 15th century with the construction of new courtyard buildings and the addition of two outer courtyards. In the 17th century there were minor alterations when musket loops were cut.

ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE IN RELATION TO PRINCIPAL TIORAM PEER GROUP

1. Intrinsic characteristics:

a. condition The main courtyard was conserved in the early 20th century and is in reasonable condition although overgrown. The two outer courtyards are in fragmentary condition. HIGH

b. archaeological interest There has been no attempt to assess the archaeological potential. NOT KNOWN.

c. developmental sequence The developmental sequence is evident from the surviving fabric though only partially relevant to the principal Tioram peer group. MODERATE

d. function Later rebuilding of the structures within the courtyard has left the functions of the original buildings unclear. MODERATE

2. Contextual characteristics:

e. rarity or representativeness It differs substantial from the general characteristics of the principal Tioram peer group; although on a loch it is not situated in a maritime context and its form is more reminiscent of Castle Sween. It is also thought to be earlier. In relation to the principal peer group its interest is low. LOW

f. relationship to other monuments It differs in substantial ways from the general characteristics of the principal Tioram peer group: it is not situated in a maritime context and its form appears more to resemble Castle Sween, although the combination of curtain wall and attached tower is superficially similar to Tioram. In relation to the principal Tioram peer group its interest is moderate. MODERATE

g. relationship to wider setting Its location reflects the power base of the Campbells, which was less definitely a maritime power than the other great families of the western Seaboard. LOW

3. Associative characteristics:

h. historical, cultural and social influences The castle is known to have existed in the early 14th century but has a number of diagnostic features which suggest an earlier date. However, these features are more comparable with Castle Sween and Rothesay Castle, than with the principal Tioram peer group. MODERATE

i. aesthetic attributes Situated on an Island in Loch Awe, it is now a heavily overgrown ruin and difficult to appreciate although attractive to the modern eye. It has drawn little artistic attention. LOW

j. significance to national consciousness NOT KNOWN

k. associations with people or events As the seat of the Campbells until the later 15th century, the castle has a significant role in the politics of the Western Highlands. However, until the growth of their power under the Bruces and then Stewarts in the later middle ages, the Campbells were in the second tier of West Coast families compared to those descended from the heirs of Somerled. LOW

C.7. KISIMUL CASTLE (Scheduled, a Property in Care and A-listed) This was the seat of the MacNeills and stands on a small rocky islet in the natural harbour of Castle Bay, at the south end of Barra. It has been variously dated to the 12th, 13th and 15th centuries, although the last of these is now considered the most likely. Its form is similar to that of other West Highland castles of the later medieval period with a rectangular tower-house set to one side of an irregular enclosure containing other buildings. The curtain wall that abuts the tower is thought to have been built later, though possibly not by very much. The Castle was restored between 1938 and 1970.

ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE IN RELATION TO PRINCIPAL TIORAM PEER GROUP

1. Intrinsic characteristics:

a. condition This site is well preserved although its restoration has introduced a number of speculative features and has disguised original fabric. However, in relation to the peer group its interest is low. LOW

b. archaeological interest Recent excavations have demonstrated that significant archaeological deposits have survived the clearance and restoration of the castle. These have indicated prehistoric as well as late medieval occupation of the site HIGH

c. developmental sequence Datable stylistic features are absent at Kisimul, and there has been much debate about its date and development. Features and details have also been obscured by 20th century restoration. However, the development of the castle, with towerhouse and then enclosure wall, is a different concept from that of the enclosure castles of the principal Tioram peer group. MODERATE

d. function While the functions for which the various buildings were constructed are broadly clear, the architecture has been modified to meet modern requirements. MODERATE

2. Contextual characteristics:

e. rarity or representativeness It is not considered to be a member of the principal Tioram peer group, but it is rather an example of the tower-enclosure castle type found elsewhere in the West Highlands (Moy, (Mull) Breachacha (Coll)) and Scotland as a whole, in the 15th century. In relation to the principal Tioram peer group its interest is low. LOW

f. relationship to other monuments It is not considered to be a member of the principal Tioram peer group. Instead it is an example of the tower-enclosure castle type found elsewhere in the West Highlands (Moy, (Mull) Breachacha, (Coll)) and Scotland as a whole, in the 15th century. In relation to the principal Tioram peer group its interest is low. LOW

g. relationship to wider setting The location of the castle within Castle Bay demonstrates the importance of sea power in this area of Scotland throughout the medieval period. HIGH

3. Associative characteristics:

h. historical, cultural and social The form of Kisimul, although superficially similar to the principal Tioram peer group, reflects a separate trend in Scottish castle building. LOW

i. aesthetic attributes Despite its rather unsympathetic mid-20th century restoration, its relationship with its seascape and landscape setting is attractive and benefits particularly from being seen from the sea. MODERATE

j. significance to national consciousness The restoration of the castle and its associations with the Clan MacNeill in the 20th century have raised the profile of the castle. MODERATE

k. associations with people or events influences As the seat of the MacNeills from their establishment of control over Barra in the early 15th century, it was a significant Hebridean castle. MODERATE

C.8. ROTHESAY CASTLE. (Scheduled, a Property in Care and A-listed) Located on the island of Bute and originally overlooking Rothesay Bay, this castle was of considerable strategic importance in the successful campaign to counter the claims of the Norwegian crown over this area of Scotland. It was probably built in the earlier 13th century by Walter the Steward, and passed to the crown with the accession of the Stewarts to the throne. As originally designed and constructed, a regular circular courtyard was defined by a high curtain wall. Four semi-circular towers were added at regular intervals around the wall later in the 13th century, and the last major augmentations were by James IV and James V in the earlier 16th century, who added a substantial residential gatehouse range. Within the courtyard a two-storeyed chapel standing to almost full height is thought to be of the same late period. There were major repairs and restorations by Lord Bute in 1871-9 and 1900, the latter concentrating particularly on the gatehouse.

ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE IN RELATION TO THE PRINCIPAL TIORAM PEER GROUP

1. Intrinsic characteristics:

a. condition , In generally excellent (albeit partly restored) condition. HIGH

b. archaeological interest There have been some archaeological investigations, but much evidence is thought to remain. HIGH

c. developmental sequence This is relatively clear from the fabric , though this is not directly relevant for the principal Tioram peer group. MODERATE

d. function Insufficient is known of the pre-16th-century buildings within the curtain wall to be sure of how the castle was used. LOW

2. Contextual characteristics:

e. rarity or representativeness It is a unique example of an initially circular curtain wall castle, as opposed to the rectangular or organically irregular variants on the enclosure theme, though this is only partly relevant for the principal Tioram peer group. HIGH

f. relationship to other monuments It is a unique example of an initially circular curtain wall castle, as opposed to the rectangular or organically irregular variants of the type, though this is probably not directly relevant for the principal Tioram peer group. MODERATE

g. relationship to wider setting Its designed relationship with Rothesay Bay and its harbour has been obscured through modern urban development. LOW

3. Associative characteristics:

h. historical, cultural and social influences As a unique and relatively early circular variant on the idea of the curtain wall castle Rothesay is of great importance, though this is not directly relevant for the principal Tioram peer group. MODERATE

i. aesthetic attributes The castle is prominently located within Rothesay, but its modern urban setting bears no relationship with its originally intended relationship with the sea. MODERATE

j. significance to national consciousness As a castle built as part of the attempt to remove Norwegian control over the west, and as an ancestral home of the Stewart dynasty, it has a high place in the national consciousness. HIGH

k. associations with people or events As a castle built as part of the attempt to remove Norwegian control over the west, and as an ancestral home of the Stewart dynasty, it has a high associative value. HIGH

D. TABLES

D.1. TABLE INDICATING THE ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE OF THE MEMBERS OF THE PRINCIPAL TIORAM PEER GROUP

Name of castle	Intrinsic 1a	1b	1c	1d	Contextual 2e	2f	2g	Associative 3h	3i	3j	3k
Castle Calvay	low	not known	not known	not known	high	high	not known	not known	low	low	not known
Castle Tioram	very high	high	high	very high	very high	very high	very high	very high	high	high	very high
Dunoon Castle	low	not known	not known	not known	moderate	moderate	not known	not known	low	low	not known
Dunstaffnage Castle	very high	very high	high	moderate	high	high	high	High	high	moderate	moderate
Duntrune Castle	high	not known	moderate	moderate	moderate	moderate	high	Not known	moderate	low	low
Dunvegan Castle	high	not known	moderate	low	moderate	low	high	Not known	moderate	high	high
Mingary Castle	high	high	high	moderate	very high	very high	very high	Very High	high	not known	moderate

D.2. TABLE INDICATING THE ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE OF THE MEMBERS OF THE SECONDARY TIORAM PEER GROUP

Name of castle	Intrinsic 1a	1b	1c	1d	Contextual 2e	2f	2g	Associative 3h	3i	3j	3k
Achadun Castle	moderate	moderate	moderate	low	low	low	moderate	moderate	low	not known	low
Breachacha Castle	low	high	moderate	moderate	low	low	moderate	Low	moderate	not known	low
Castle Lachlan	moderate	not known	moderate	moderate	moderate	moderate	moderate	moderate	moderate	not known	moderate
Castle Sween	high	high	moderate	moderate	moderate	moderate	high	moderate	moderate	not known	high
Duart Castle	high	not known	high	moderate	moderate	moderate	very high	High	high	moderate	high
Innis Chonnell Castle	high	not known	moderate	moderate	low	moderate	low	moderate	low	not known	low
Kisimul Castle	low	high	moderate	moderate	low	low	high	Low	moderate	moderate	moderate
Rothsay Castle	high	high	moderate	low	high	moderate	low	moderate	moderate	high	high

E. SUMMARY OF THE SIGNIFICANCE OF CASTLE TIORAM

1. Tioram is the clearest representative of a second generation of West Highland stone castles, dating from the mid-14th century. It combines the forms of an enclosure castle and a 'hall house' in a manner previously unrecognised in Scotland.
2. Unlike its counterparts, Tioram was associated with a single family (Clanranald) for over three centuries, and remained relatively untouched after that; it is a rare unmodified reflection of the lifestyle of a Gaelic lord and his kindred.
3. Like a number of other West Coast castles, it was the mainland outpost of a great maritime estate, but was possibly unique in having its demesne and family burial place located over sixty nautical miles distant.
4. Its associations with significant aspects of Gaelic lordship and culture, especially as developed in the 16th and 17th centuries, are still physically expressed and echoed in the surviving architecture in a way not seen elsewhere.
5. It is a building whose architecture is at the same time both particularly challenging and highly rewarding for those with a specialist interest in castle studies, with unusually great potential for further investigation and analysis.